*Catcher in the Rye*/*Dead Poet’s Society*

Purpose: -to demonstrate knowledge and understanding of the novel

-to demonstrate ability to analyse through comparison

-to demonstrate ability to express thoughts and knowledge in a formal, academic, organized manner

-to demonstrate ability to apply writing, editing and language skills

Audience: your teacher

Assignment: -write a formal, well-developed, five paragraph essay that compares the novel *Catcher in*

*the Rye* and the movie *Dead Poet’s Society* on a literary basis (theme AND character)

**Determine a theme that is shared by the two texts and use three characters from each text to explain how they help to support the theme.**

Parameters: -formal, academic language

-MLA format (see handouts and course website)

-minimum of three properly cited, primary quotations to support your arguments (one

per paragraph)

-five paragraph essay structure

Process: -includes a formal outline that MUST be approved by your teacher before the final copy

is accepted

OUTLINE DUE DATE: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

ROUGH DRAFT DUE DATE: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ (peer assessment)

FINAL COPY DUE DATE: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

Example thesis based on theme and character using *The Hunger Games* and *1984.*

Let’s say you are arguing that oppressive government control is a prominent theme in Suzanne Collins *The Hunger Games* and George Orwell’s *1984*, and will show how this is depicted through the experiences of **youth**, adults, and the elderly (2 youth, one from each text, 2 adults, one from each text, etc.).

|  |
| --- |
| THESIS: Despite a government’s purpose to support and sustain a healthy society, they often use oppressive control which stifles and suppresses the people, as depicted by the citizens of Panem in *The Hunger Games* andof Airstrip One in *1984.* |

\*Before the thesis statement in your introduction write 3 supporting sentences to set up your direction (one sentence to address oppressive government control on youth, one sentence to address control on adults, etc.)

\*Body paragraph one will discuss how **youth** suffer as a result of oppressive government control, providing evidence using the character Katniss (HG) and Julia (1984).

**Format of Comparative Essay**

**Introduction**

* A Hook: a statement, quotation, reflection, question, to direct the readers’ interest into the essay.
* Introduction to the works (title, author) and the elements you are comparing
* 3 Supporting Statements (setting up your direction, must be overarching and support the thesis)

**Supporting statement #1 from Introduction:“**The youth in any society are often seen as hope for a brighter future, however, in some cases, youth are often used to create an maintain a dire state.

**BODY PARAGRAPH #1**

TOPIC SENTENCE The actions and beliefs of youth in many societies are oppressively controlled and used by their governments to fulfill their agendas, despite the ideal of freedom and prosperity which many young people desire. POINT #1 As seen through Cato of District 2, the youth of certain districts in Panem are taught by the Capitol to believe that participating in the Hunger Games brings prosperity and honour so that the games themselves can be used to manipulate the citizens. PROOF #1This is seen when Cato says, “Insert quote or example of how Cato is suppressed by the control of the capitol.” EXPLANATION #1 Cato’s lifelong dedication to the games through “physical and mental preparation” not only stifles him, but also puts youth from other poorer districts at a severe disadvantage…TRANSITIONAL PHRASE Much like Cato, Julia of Airstrip One finds herself a pawn in Big Brother’s endeavour to…POINT #2…

* The Thesis Statement (what the whole essay proves)

**Body Paragraph One (proves supporting statement #1 from Introduction**

Topic sentence -- states your argument

Point #1—deals with character #1

Proof #1—character#1

Explanation #1—explains how character #1 supports the theme and thesis

Transitional phrase—link the two characters

Point #2—deals with character #2

Proof #2—character #2

Explanation #2: explains how character #2 supports the theme and thesis

Link to thesis and further compare & contrast: discuss how both prove the thesis

Concluding Sentence: sum up the paragraph.

**Body Paragraph Two (proves supporting statement #2 from Introduction)**

Topic sentence -- states your argument

Point #1—deals with character #1

Proof #1—character #1

Explanation #1—explains how character #1 supports the theme and thesis

Transitional phrase-- link the two characters

Point #2—deals with character #2

Proof #2—character #2

Explanation #2: explains how character #2 supports the theme and thesis

Link to thesis and further compare & contrast: discuss how both prove the thesis

Concluding Sentence: sum up the paragraph.

**Body Paragraph Three (proves supporting statement #3 from Introduction)**

Topic sentence -- states your argument

Point #1—deals with character #1

Proof #1—character #1

Explanation #1—explains how character #1 supports the theme and thesis

Transitional phrase-- link the two characters

Point #2—deals with character #2

Proof #2—character #2

Explanation #2: explains how character #2 supports the theme and thesis

Link to thesis and further compare & contrast: discuss how both prove the thesis

Concluding Sentence: sum up the paragraph.

**Conclusion**

* Restate Thesis (reword)
* Mention the work you discussed and the topics you compared
* End with a general statement
* NO NEW INFO

**Editing the Compare and Contrast Essay**

**Step 1: Self Revision.**

-Read your essay over and making changes in a different coloured en.

As you are reading it look for:

1. Redundant language (eliminate it)
2. Unnecessary repetition (eliminate it)
3. Awkward phrases (change it)
4. Unclear sentences (change it)
5. Add transitions where needed (add)
6. Add links to thesis where needed (add)

**Step 2: Find a Peer Editor**

My peer editor is \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

*Instructions for the peer editor:*

1. Read over the essay.
2. As you read circle any spelling and grammar errors.
3. Complete the check list.
4. Answer the questions at the end of the checklist

**Step 3: Review your Peer Editors Comments**

-Review your peer editor’s comments and make appropriate changes. Look at the checklist and add any missing elements.

**Step 4: Review the Rubric**

-Be sure to reread the rubric and the assignment sheet before you complete your final draft.

**Peer Editors Checklist:**

The writer should have each of the following elements in the order they appear on this list. Place a checkmark beside the statement if it is present and in the right order. Do nothing if it is not present or out of order.

**Introduction**

\_\_\_\_\_\_A Hook: a statement, quotation, reflection, question, to direct out interest into the essay.

\_\_\_\_\_\_Introduction to the work (title, author) and the characters you are comparing

\_\_\_\_\_\_3 Supporting Statements (setting up direction, must be overarching and support the thesis

\_\_\_\_\_\_The Thesis Statement (what the whole essay proves; can, but does not have to include direction if stated clearly

above)

**Body Paragraph One (proves supporting statement #1)**

\_\_\_\_\_\_Topic sentence -- states your argument

\_\_\_\_\_\_Point #1—deals with character #1

\_\_\_\_\_\_Proof #1—character #1

\_\_\_\_\_\_Explanation—explains how character#1 supports the theme and thesis

\_\_\_\_\_\_Transitional phrase—link the two characters

\_\_\_\_\_\_Point #2—deals with character#2

\_\_\_\_\_\_Proof #2—character #2

\_\_\_\_\_\_Explanation: explains how character #2 supports the theme and thesis

\_\_\_\_\_\_Link to thesis and further compare & contrast: discuss how **both** prove the thesis

\_\_\_\_\_\_Concluding Sentence: sum up the paragraph and transition to next.

**Body Paragraph Two (proves supporting statement #2)**

\_\_\_\_\_\_Topic sentence -- states your argument

\_\_\_\_\_\_Point #1—deals with character #1

\_\_\_\_\_\_Proof #1—character #1

\_\_\_\_\_\_Explanation—explains how character #1 supports the theme and thesis

\_\_\_\_\_\_Transitional phrase—link the two characters

\_\_\_\_\_\_Point #2—deals with characters#2

\_\_\_\_\_\_Proof #2—characters#2

\_\_\_\_\_\_Explanation: explains how character#2 supports the theme and thesis

\_\_\_\_\_\_Link to thesis and further compare & contrast: discuss how **both** prove the thesis

\_\_\_\_\_\_Concluding Sentence: sum up the paragraph and transition to next.

**Body Paragraph Three (proves supporting statement #3)**

\_\_\_\_\_\_Topic sentence -- states your argument

\_\_\_\_\_\_Point #1—deals with character #1

\_\_\_\_\_\_Proof #1—character #1

\_\_\_\_\_\_Explanation—explains how character #1 supports the theme and thesis

\_\_\_\_\_\_Transitional phrase—link the two characters

\_\_\_\_\_\_Point #2—deals with character#2

\_\_\_\_\_\_Proof #2—charcter#2

\_\_\_\_\_\_Explanation: explains how character#2 supports the theme and thesis

\_\_\_\_\_\_Link to thesis and further compare & contrast: discuss how **both** prove the thesis

\_\_\_\_\_\_Concluding Sentence: sum up the paragraph and transition to next.

**Conclusion**

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_Restate Thesis (reword)

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_Mention the work you discussed and the topics you compared

\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_End with a general statement

**Peer Editor Questions & Comments**

Before completing these questions read the rubric to review the qualities of a level 4. Your comments should be phrased to help the author reach a level 4.

1. List three aspects of the essay you feel were well done?
2. In what ways could the author strength his/her argument?
3. Which body paragraph is the strongest? Explain.
4. Which body paragraph is the weakest? How can it be improved?
5. Comment on the quality of evidence used? How could it be improved?
6. Are all ideas explicitly linked back to the thesis? Which ideas need great links?
7. What are 2 aspects the author should try to improve?

**ENG 3UI Comparison /Contrast Essay Rubric**

**Name: \_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ Essay Title\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_ Due Date:\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_**

|  |  |  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
|  |  | **4** | **3** | **2** | **1** | **R - 0** |
| **T** | **Thesis** | Argument reduced to one accurate, arguable statement, specific and clearly worded, expressing a complex and true idea. Excellent supporting ideas & development of argument | Argument reduced to one accurate, arguable statement, specific and clearly worded. Good supporting ideas & development of argument | Argument in one accurate, arguable statement, specific **or** clearly worded, of limited interest. Adequate support & development of argument | Argument reduced to one statement of little interest.  Few adequate supporting ideas & development of argument | No thesis, or thesis vague or poorly worded, confuses. Inadequate supporting ideas & development of argument |
| **T** | **Process Work** | Excellent use of process work as it is detailed and completed with care. Includes chapter notes, brainstorming, outline, rough draft with evidence of revision and a final draft. | All process work is completed with care. | Missing one part of the process work or many aspects of the process work need more detail. | Missing 2 aspects of the process work or has completed process work with minimal detail. | Process work not submitted or insufficient process work submitted. |
| **K** | **Resources-**  **The literature** | Clear, convincing, specific references made to the literature in support of thesis; significant quotations used; demonstrates detailed knowledge of the texts.  Quotations introduced with clear context and explained  fully | Quotations used to create a convincing argument; informed knowledge of the literature is evident.  Quotations introduced and explained | Inadequate quotations used to convince; adequate knowledge of the literature is in doubt.  Quotations sometimes introduced and explained | Irrelevant or misleading quotations used; knowledge of the literature is in serious doubt.  Quotations not introduced and explained | No quotations used or quotations vague or misleading indicating little knowledge of the literature. |
| **K** | **Conventions** | Correct documenting, and Works Cited; Appropriate presentation. | Mostly correct | Some significant errors | Several significant errors | Components missing |
| **C** | **Structure**  Paragraphing  Transitions  Introduction  Conclusion | Complete coherence and clarity attained through  - Appropriate **Paragraphing** (for idea,  Subject) Topic sentence, conclusion.  - Appropriate **Transitions**  - Complete **Introduction** (topics, titles,  authors, thesis, supports)  - Complete **Conclusion** (thesis restated,  Proofs summarized, authors, titles) | Generally clear and coherent, attained through:  **P**aragraphing  **T**ransitions  **I**ntroduction  **C**onclusion | Some clarity and/or coherence, attained through some of:  **P**aragraphing  **T**ransitions  **I**ntroduction  **C**onclusion | Little clarity or coherence:  **P**aragraphing  **T**ransitions  **I**ntroduction  **C**onclusion  Seriously misused or absent | Mostly unclear and/or incoherent |
| **C** | **Structure**  Comparison-contrast | Excellent point by point comparison that emphasizes similarities/differences in ideas | Point by point comparison that points out similarities/differences | Unclear point by point comparison | Weak point by point comparison | Unpatterned comparison/contrast which impairs clarity |
| **C** | **Language-**  **Style** | Forcefully persuades through the use of varied and appropriate diction and sentence structure; (uses figurative language effectively) | Persuades through the use of varied and appropriate diction and sentence structure; (uses figurative language effectively) | Persuades through the use of diction and sentence structure; (uses figurative language somewhat effectively) | Little persuasion through the use of diction and sentence structure; (little figurative language) | Not persuasive |
| **C** | **Language-**  **Correctness** | Evidence of revision in virtually accurate spelling and grammar. Uses present tense. | Evidence of revision in accurate spelling, correct grammar, and verb tense. | Some evidence of revision in generally correct spelling and grammar. Inconsistent tense. | Little evidence of revision in often incorrect spelling and grammar | No evidence of revision |

**\*Remember work will not be evaluated without rough work!!!**

Name:\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_\_

COMPARATIVE ESSAY OUTLINE

**INTRODUCTION**

3 SUPPORTING IDEAS

|  |
| --- |
|  |
|  |
|  |

THESIS STATEMENT

|  |
| --- |
|  |
|  |

**BODY PARAGRAPH #1**

TOPIC SENTENCE (use similar phrasing to thesis).

|  |
| --- |
|  |
|  |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| #1 *Catcher in the Rye* | #2 *Dead Poet’s Society* |
| Point | Point |
| Proof | Proof |
| Explanation | Explanation |

**BODY PARAGRAPH #2**

TOPIC SENTENCE (use similar phrasing to thesis).

|  |
| --- |
|  |
|  |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| #1 *Catcher in the Rye* | #2 *Dead Poet’s Society* |
| Point | Point |
| Proof | Proof |
| Explanation | Explanation |

**BODY PARAGRAPH #3**

TOPIC SENTENCE (use similar phrasing to thesis).

|  |
| --- |
|  |
|  |

|  |  |
| --- | --- |
| #1 *Catcher in the Rye* | #2 *Dead Poet’s Society* |
| Point | Point |
| Proof | Proof |
| Explanation | Explanation |